

Immigration Policy Debate



House of Representatives:
Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims

Options in Brief

Option 1: Open Ourselves to the World

As we enter the twenty-first century, the forces of globalization are rapidly creating a new world. International trade is steadily expanding, while national borders are losing their significance. People, ideas, and goods traverse the globe at an ever-accelerating pace. Americans can take pride in a heritage that promotes openness, tolerance, and diversity. Immigration puts our country in touch with the tastes and preferences of consumers worldwide, and gives U.S. companies an edge in opening export markets. Keeping our doors open lets the world know that the United States remains a country that looks forward to tomorrow.

Option 2: Make Emigration Unnecessary

As the new century unfolds, the world is on the move. The population explosion in poor countries, the spread of war and terror, and the age-old curses of hunger and disease are driving increasing numbers to our shores. Opening our doors to large-scale immigration resolves no one's problems. It only overburdens our schools and health care system and drains poor countries of many of their most educated, highly skilled workers. We cannot continue to absorb new immigrants into this country at this breakneck pace without compromising our own economy and social structure. Nonetheless, both for practical and for humanitarian reasons we should join with the international community to provide the development assistance necessary to stabilize the migration of the world's poor.

Option 3: Admit the Talent We Need

Economic competition among nations in the twenty-first century is set to reach new levels of intensity. In today's world, the United States must be prepared to compete in an increasingly demanding global marketplace. Immigration policy should be designed first to serve our country's economic needs, not to solve the world's problems. To spur American high-tech industries forward, our doors should be open to scientists and engineers from abroad. To help American factories, farms, and service industries hold down costs, we should allow a limited number of foreigners to work temporarily in low-wage jobs.

Option 4: Restrict Immigration

The world is changing at a breakneck pace. The population explosion, war, terror, hunger, and disease plague an ever-growing portion of humanity. We must recognize that Americans can do little to end the misery that haunts much of the world. Simply maintaining our way of life amounts to a major challenge. Although the United States is a nation of immigrants, the arguments supporting massive immigration have long since passed into history. Now it is time to say enough. We should drastically reduce the number of immigrants we accept and commit the resources necessary to take control of our borders.

Presenting Your Option

Preparing Your Presentation

Your Assignment: Your group has been called upon to appear before the Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims of the House of Representatives. Your assignment is to persuade the subcommittee members that your option should be the basis for U.S. policy. You will be judged on how well you present your option.

Organizing Your Group: Each member of your group will take a specific role. Below is a brief explanation of the responsibilities for each role. Before preparing your section of the presentation, work together to address the questions on the "Expressing Key Values" worksheet.

1. Group Organizer: Your job is to organize your group's three-to-five minute presentation to the Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims. In organizing your presentation, you will receive help from the other members of your group. Read your option and review the reading to build a strong case for your option. Keep in mind that although you are expected to take the lead in organizing your group, your group will be expected to make the presentation together.

2. Domestic Policy Analyst: Your job is to explain how your option would improve the lives of Americans here at home. Carefully

read your option, and then review Part II of the reading. Make sure that your area of expertise is reflected in the presentation of your group.

3. Foreign Policy Analyst: Your job is to explain how your option would address our international interests. Carefully read your option, and then review Part II of the reading. Make sure that your area of expertise is reflected in the presentation of your group.

4. Historian: Your job is to show how the lessons of history support your option. Carefully read your option, and then review Part I of the reading. Make sure that your area of expertise is reflected in the presentation of your group.

Making Your Case

After your preparations are completed, your group will deliver a three-to-five minute presentation to the Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims. The "Expressing Key Values" worksheet and other notes may be used, but you should speak clearly and convincingly. During the other presentations, you should try to identify the weak points of the other options. After all of the groups have presented their options, members of the subcommittee will ask you clarifying questions. Any member of your group may respond during the cross-examination period.

Expressing Key Values

The notion of values lies at the core of this unit. Each of the four options in this unit revolves around a distinct set of values. The opening two paragraphs of your option are devoted to making a convincing case for the values that are represented. The term “values,” however, is not easy to define. Most often, we think of values in connection with our personal lives. Our attitudes toward our families, friends, and communities are a reflection of our personal values.

Values play a critical role in our civic life as well. In the United States, a wide range of values has shaped our country’s political system and foreign policy. The high value many Americans place on freedom, democracy, and individual liberty rings loudly throughout U.S. history. For most of our country’s existence, the desire to remain independent of foreign

entanglements outweighed the impulse to spread American values beyond our borders. Since World War II, however, the United States has played a larger role in world affairs than any other nation. At times, American leaders have emphasized the values of human rights and cooperation. On other occasions, they have stressed the values of stability and security. Many of these values have entered into the debate on immigration reform.

Some values fit together well. Others are in conflict. Americans are constantly being forced to choose among competing values in our ongoing discussion of public policy. Your job is to identify and explain the most important values underlying your option. These values should be clearly expressed by every member of your group. This worksheet will help you organize your thoughts.

1. What are the two most important values underlying your option?

a.

b.

2. According to the values of your option, what image should the United States project to the world?

3. Why should the values of your option serve as the basis for our country’s immigration policy?

Option 1: Open Ourselves to the World

At the beginning of the twenty-first century, the forces of globalization are rapidly creating a new world. International trade is steadily expanding, while national borders are losing their significance. People, ideas, and goods traverse the globe at an ever-accelerating pace. In the world of the future, the United States will stand out as a shining example. While rigid nationalism continues to hold back many countries, Americans can take pride in a heritage that promotes openness, tolerance, and diversity. Compared to our chief economic rivals in Asia and Western Europe, the United States is poised to compete in the international marketplace. American movies, music, fashion, and brand names are attractive to people throughout the world because they symbolize a culture that embraces and celebrates many cultures. Immigration puts our country in touch with the tastes and preferences of consumers worldwide, and gives U.S. companies an edge in opening export markets.

From its earliest days, the United States has been a land of opportunity for people outside our borders. Each wave of immigrants has contributed to the United States' greatness and enriched our society. Today, immigrants are still coming. This latest generation of immigrants contains the best and brightest from a rich variety of cultures and regions. Even those lacking a formal education are driven by a strong sense of initiative and an unshakable work ethic. They have come because they believe the United States is the land of opportunity. They recognize that the United States rewards hard work and ability like no other country in the world. In the end, the talents, ambitions, and dreams they bring will benefit all Americans. Keeping our doors open lets the world know that the United States remains a country that looks forward to tomorrow.

What policies should we pursue?

- Remove bureaucratic obstacles in the immigration process that keep family members apart.
- Allow people worldwide with a legitimate fear of persecution the full protection of U.S. refugee and asylum laws.
- Adjust immigration laws to permit greater immigration from countries such as China and Mexico that have been the

victims of unfair restrictions in the past.

- Provide immigrants with more opportunities, job training, and English-language instruction to speed their adjustment to American life.
- Ensure that everyone in the United States, including illegal immigrants, has access to education, basic health care, and other essential services.

Option 1 is based on the following beliefs

- America is still a young, vigorous country with room to grow.
- America's strength lies in its diversity, particularly in the fresh ideas and cultures provided by new immigrants.

- Immigration does not unduly threaten our national security.
- America needs immigrants to contribute to our economic growth.

Arguments for

1. Welcoming new immigrants into our country will inject valuable skills into the U.S. economy and enable American culture to maintain the rich diversity that appeals to consumers the world over.
2. Renewing the United States' long tradition of offering opportunity and refuge for immigrants will earn the United States respect and admiration from people throughout the world.
3. Immigrants will take advantage of their ties to their native countries to open up new export markets for American products.

Arguments against

1. If immigration continues at its current pace, more than fifty million newcomers will flood into the United States in the next half century, overloading our schools, hospitals, and other social services.
2. An open immigration policy will inevitably make it easier for would-be terrorists to enter the country undetected.
3. High levels of immigration will deprive American workers of jobs while forcing government to spend more on the needs of immigrants.
4. Encouraging highly skilled workers to immigrate to the United States robs poor countries of their most valuable human resources.
5. Opening our doors to unskilled immigrants at a time when the U.S. economy offers them few opportunities will only add to our society's problems.
6. High levels of immigration will push our country's population past tolerable limits and inflict still more harm on our country's environment.
7. The continual arrival of large numbers of immigrants, both legal and illegal, will eventually overwhelm American culture and contribute to the fragmentation of our society.

Option 2: Make Emigration Unnecessary

As the new century unfolds, the world is on the move. The population explosion in poor countries, the spread of war and terror, and the age-old curses of hunger and disease are driving increasing numbers to our shores. Emigration from the developing world is at an all time high, and the United States is the destination for the largest percentage of these emigrants. Opening our doors to large-scale immigration resolves no one's problems. Admitting huge numbers of newcomers into the United States every year not only overburdens our schools and health care system, it drains poor countries of many of their most educated, highly skilled workers. This "brain drain" only adds to the challenge in poor countries of meeting the needs of their own populations.

We are a strong country, but we cannot continue to absorb new immigrants into this country at this breakneck pace and without compromising our own economy and social structure. Nonetheless, both for practical and for humanitarian reasons we cannot fence ourselves off from poverty and suffering outside of our borders. As the strongest economic power on earth and the most sought destination of the world's poor, the burden of international leadership on this issue rests with the United States. We should join with the international community to provide the development assistance necessary to stabilize the migration of the world's poor. We should also explore ways to create incentives for the best and brightest in the developing world to stay where they are and contribute their skills to improve conditions in their own countries. By improving life among the world's poor and disadvantaged, we can get a grip on the forces that drive desperate immigrants to our country's shores. Ultimately, we will all be better off.

What policies should we pursue?

- Expand foreign aid and trade benefits to help governments in the developing world to strengthen their economies and reduce the flow of immigration to the United States.
- Join other developed countries to coordinate the resettlement of existing refugees and prevent future refugee crises.
- Apply consistent, humane standards in granting political asylum to refugees, rather than mold refugee policy to suit political purposes.
- Reduce the number of immigration visas awarded annually to 600,000, including refugees.

Option 2 is based on the following beliefs

- In today's interconnected world, we must accept that the problems affecting other countries are America's problems as well.

- By developing well-crafted programs of foreign aid and trade benefits, the United States can help people in poor

countries improve their lives.

- While we have an obligation to reduce suffering wherever possible, we have a primary responsibility to the well-being of those here at home.

Arguments for

1. Expanding foreign aid programs and trade benefits for the developing world will reduce the drain of highly skilled workers from poor countries and also reduce the anger that fuels terrorism.

2. Developing refugee policies that are consistent and humane will bolster the U.S. image throughout the world.

3. Reducing the level of immigration to the United States will reduce the drain on our social service resources and allow us to better monitor those who come.

Arguments against

1. Dumping money into new foreign aid programs will come at the expense of addressing other, more pressing needs.

2. Closing our doors to immigrants will increase resentment of the United States.

3. Awarding immigration visas on the basis of humanitarian concerns, rather than economic priorities, will not significantly lower U.S. spending on social services for newcomers.

4. As past failures show, U.S. assistance can not overcome the crippling poverty and social chaos plaguing much of the developing world.

5. Without high levels of immigration, the United States will lack the talent and energy to strengthen our country and address future problems.

6. No matter what we do, people will always want to come to the United States.

Option 3: Admit the Talent We Need

Economic competition among nations in the twenty-first century is set to reach new levels of intensity. In today's world, the United States must be prepared to compete in an increasingly demanding global marketplace and adapt to the relentless pace of technological change. In the last few years, our country's economy has been going through a wrenching readjustment. Businesses are cutting jobs. Government programs are being trimmed. Workers are being forced to do more with less. While our economy has emerged from the trials of downsizing leaner and stronger, the economic recession that hit the first years of the new century took a toll. We must make sure that our country's immigration policy is in line with our economic priorities. After calling on working Americans to tighten their belts, we owe them nothing less.

Every country has the right to promote its national interests. The United States should be no different. We cannot afford to admit into our country every year hundreds of thousands of newcomers who will be a burden on our society. Immigration policy should be designed first to serve our country's economic needs, not to solve the world's problems. A two-pronged approach makes the most sense. To spur American high-tech industries forward, our doors should be open to scientists and engineers from abroad. To help American factories, farms, and service industries hold down costs, we should allow a limited number of foreigners to work temporarily in low-wage jobs. By forging ahead with a realistic, far-sighted strategy, we can make immigration policy work for the United States.

What policies should we pursue?

- Award 200,000 immigration visas annually for skilled workers and their families, making the advancement of science and technology the top priority in guiding immigration policy.

- Reduce total annual immigration to 500,000, including refugees, making adjustments to reflect economic conditions. (During an economic downturn, the number of immigration visas should be decreased, while during an economic expansion the number should be increased.)

- Allow a limited number of foreigners to work temporarily in the United States in a guest worker program for agriculture and other industries facing labor shortages.

- Offer scholarships to foreign graduate students in science, engineering, and other high-tech fields, provided they will work in the United States for at least five years.

- Deny education, health care, and other social services to illegal aliens, except in cases of emergency.

Option 3 is based on the following beliefs

- Maintaining our economy's competitive edge is essential to the well-being of Americans.
- Promoting America's economic strength should be the guiding principle underlying our country's immigration policy.

Arguments for

1. Admitting highly skilled immigrants who are well-suited to the demands of the U.S. economy will help hold down government costs for welfare, health care, and other social services.
2. Tailoring U.S. immigration policy to the needs of our economy will attract immigrants who have the most to offer to American industry, especially in high-tech fields.
3. Permitting the entry of temporary foreign workers into the labor force will help low-wage industries remain in the United States while competing in the global market.

- Skilled, well-educated immigrants are most capable of contributing to the betterment of the United States.

Arguments against

1. Limiting immigration to the well-educated discriminates against worthy applicants who have been deprived of an opportunity to educate themselves.
2. Pursuing an immigration policy that overlooks the concerns of other countries will damage U.S. foreign relations, especially with our neighbors to the south.
3. Drawing the best and brightest skilled workers from poor countries will undercut economic development in much of the world and harm international stability.
4. Admitting foreigners as temporary workers and denying social services to illegal aliens will create a group of second-class citizens with few rights and little stake in American society.
5. Reducing the number of immigration visas available for family reunification will leave many close relatives separated.
6. Assisting foreign graduate students in science and engineering will deprive Americans of jobs and educational opportunities, and leave many of our most important high-tech industries dominated by foreign-born workers.

Option 4: Restrict Immigration

The world is changing at a breakneck pace. The population explosion, war, terror, hunger, and disease plague an ever-growing portion of humanity. The United States is a strong country, but it cannot solve the world's problems. As the planet's population soars from six billion today to an estimated ten billion by the year 2050, we must recognize that Americans can do little to end the misery that haunts much of the world. On the contrary, the forces of economic change have left millions of Americans struggling to keep up. Many of us are working longer hours than ever just to make ends meet. Schools are overcrowded and underfunded, while health care costs have skyrocketed. Simply maintaining our way of life amounts to a major challenge.

The arguments supporting massive immigration in the United States have long since passed into history. At a time when our country is trimming back social services for our own citizens, we can hardly afford to keep the door open every year to roughly one million newcomers from poor nations. The world's disadvantaged people cannot be blamed for wanting to enter the United States. Many of them lead lives of desperation and hopelessness. But the United States has already given enough. For decades, we have accepted more immigrants than all the other countries of the world combined. Now it is time to say stop. We have the right to preserve the uniquely American culture that has been created over the past two centuries. We have a duty to stop the senseless influx of unskilled immigrants that holds down wages for struggling American workers. We should drastically reduce the number of immigrants we accept and commit the resources necessary to take control of our borders. The threat of runaway change must be brought under control.

What policies should we pursue?

- Reduce the number of immigration visas awarded annually to the level set in 1965—290,000—including refugees.
- Strengthen border control by tripling the number of Border Patrol agents, constructing impassable barriers at major crossing points along the U.S.-Mexican border, and swiftly deporting foreigners who overstay their visas.
- Introduce a national identity card that all workers would be required to present when applying for employment and social services.
- Pressure other governments to take steps to prevent mass movements of refugees to the United States.
- Insist that those seeking political asylum apply at U.S. embassies in foreign countries.
- End the policy of granting automatic citizenship to the children of foreigners born in the United States.

Option 4 is based on the following beliefs

- The United States is one of the few islands of stability and prosperity in a world marked largely by poverty and desperation.
- Continued high levels of immigration would overwhelm America's unique culture.

Arguments for

1. Reducing immigration will allow the United States to hold down spending for education, health care, and other social services.
2. Restoring firm control over our borders will help us reduce the flow of drugs into the United States and strengthen our defenses against international terrorism.
3. Lowering the number of newcomers entering the U.S. labor market will make more jobs available for American workers, especially those with few skills.

- High levels of immigration deprive America's poor of opportunities for economic advancement.

Arguments against

1. Fencing off our neighbors to the south and restricting immigration from abroad will fuel anti-American sentiment throughout the world, and harm relations with many of our leading trading partners.
2. Closing the door on new immigrants will deprive the American work force of skills, talent, and ambition.
3. Introducing a national identity card will make foreign-born Americans a target for suspicion and discrimination.
4. Industries which rely on immigrant labor will face hardships, causing repercussions in other areas of the economy.
5. Drastically reducing immigration will create a society that lacks a solid understanding of the world beyond our borders.
6. Without young immigrants entering the country, American workers will face a heavy burden in supporting the steadily increasing elderly population.
7. Severely cutting back immigration will leave many recently arrived Americans separated from close family members in their native lands.

Focusing Your Thoughts

Instructions

You have had an opportunity to consider four options on U.S. immigration policy. Now it is your turn to look at each of the options from your own perspective. Try each one on for size. Think about how the options address your concerns and hopes. You will find that each has its own risks and trade-offs, advantages and disadvantages. After you complete this worksheet, you will be asked to develop your own option on this issue.

Ranking the Options

Which of the options below do you prefer? Rank the options, with "1" being the best option for the United States to follow.

___ Option 1: Open Ourselves to the World

___ Option 2: Make Emigration Unnecessary

___ Option 3: Admit the Talent We Need

___ Option 4: Restrict Immigration

Beliefs

Considering the statements below will help you answer the first four questions of "Your Option Five."

Rate each of the statements below according to your personal beliefs:

1 = Strongly Support 2 = Support 3 = Oppose 4 = Strongly Oppose 5 = Undecided

___ U.S. policy should be based on a realistic assessment of U.S. national interests, not on lofty international ideals.

___ As the most powerful nation in the world, the United States is capable of addressing suffering abroad while helping the disadvantaged here at home.

___ U.S. national security begins by protecting U.S. borders.

___ The problems affecting most poor countries are only going to get worse, regardless of U.S. assistance programs overseas.

___ The United States must remain a symbol of hope and opportunity for the people of the world.

___ Americans will face a struggle in the coming decades just to maintain their present lifestyle.

___ The greatness of the United States is based on its diversity and openness to fresh ideas.

___ The United States cannot isolate itself from problems beyond our borders.

___ The ability to compete in the global economy will determine the fate of the United States in the coming century.

Creating Your Own Option

Your next assignment is to create an option that reflects your own beliefs and opinions. You may borrow heavily from one option, or you may combine ideas from two or three options. Or you may take a new approach altogether. There is no right or wrong answer. Rather, you should strive to craft an option that is logical and persuasive. Be careful of contradictions. For example, you should not sharply reduce immigration if you believe that cultural diversity and fresh ideas are essential to our country's strength.

Your Option Five

Instructions: In this exercise, you will offer your own recommendations for U.S. immigration policy. Your responses to “Focusing Your Thoughts” should help you answer the first four questions.

1. How many legal immigrants, including refugees, should the United States allow to enter the country every year? Explain the basis of your decision.

2. How should the United States decide which applicants for immigration are admitted into the country?

3. How should the United States deal with the issue of illegal immigrants?

4. What image of the United States does your option project to the rest of the world?

5. What are the two strongest arguments opposing your option?
 - a.

 - b.

6. What are the two strongest arguments supporting your option?
 - a.

 - b.

Role-Playing the Four Options: Organization and Preparation

Objectives:

Students will: Analyze the issues that frame the debate on U.S. immigration policy.

Identify the core underlying values of the options.

Integrate the arguments and beliefs of the options and the readings into a persuasive, coherent presentation.

Work cooperatively within groups to organize effective presentations.

Required Reading:

Students should have read Part II in the student text (pages 8-16) and completed “Study Guide—Part II” (TRB 9-10) or “Advanced Study Guide—Part II” (TRB-11).

Handouts:

“Presenting Your Option” (TRB-17) for option groups

“Expressing Key Values” (TRB-18) for option groups

“Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims” (TRB-19) for subcommittee members

In the Classroom:

1. Planning for Group Work—In order to save time in the classroom, form student groups before beginning Day Three. During the class period of Day Three, students will be preparing for the Day Four simulation. Remind them to incorporate the reading into the development of their presentations and questions.

2a. Option Groups—Form four groups of four students. Assign an option to each group. Distribute “Presenting Your Option” and “Expressing Key Values” to the four option

groups. Inform students that each option group will be called upon on Day Four to present the case for its assigned option to the House Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims. Explain that option groups should follow the instructions in “Presenting Your Option.” Note that the option groups should begin by assigning each member a role.

2b. Subcommittee Members—The remainder of the class will serve as members of the Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims. Distribute “Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims” to each subcommittee member. While the option groups are preparing their presentations, members of the subcommittee should develop clarifying questions for Day Four. (See “Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims.”) Remind subcommittee members that they are expected to turn in their questions at the end of the simulation.

Suggestions:

In smaller classes, other teachers or administrators may be invited to serve as members of the subcommittee. In larger classes, additional roles—such as those of newspaper reporter or lobbyist—may be assigned to students.

Extra Challenge:

Ask the option groups to design a poster or a political cartoon illustrating the best case for their options.

Homework:

Students should complete preparations for the simulation.

Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims Hearing on U.S. Immigration Policy

Your Role:

You serve as a member of the Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims in the House of Representatives. Your subcommittee is the starting point for much of the legislation affecting U.S. immigration policy. As you know, the rapid pace of change internationally and new challenges here at home have again placed immigration in the national spotlight. These hearings will introduce you to four distinct approaches to this question.

Your Assignment:

While the four option groups are organizing their presentations, you should prepare two questions regarding each of the options. Your teacher will collect these questions.

Your questions should be challenging and designed to clarify the differences among the options. For example, a good question for Option 1 might be:

Isn't there a danger that high levels of immigration will overburden our country's social service system?

On Day Four, the four option groups will present their positions. After their presentations are completed, your teacher will call on you and your fellow subcommittee members to ask questions. The "Evaluation Form" you receive is designed for you to record your impressions of the option groups. Part I should be filled out in class after the option groups make their presentations. Part II should be completed as homework. After this activity is concluded, you may be called upon to explain your evaluation of the option groups.

Role-Playing the Four Options: Debate and Discussion

Objectives:

Students will: Articulate the leading values that frame the debate on U.S. immigration policy.

Explore, debate, and evaluate multiple perspectives on U.S. immigration policy.

Sharpen rhetorical skills through debate and discussion.

Cooperate with classmates in staging a persuasive presentation.

Handouts:

"Evaluation Form" (TRB-21) for the subcommittee members

In the Classroom:

1. Setting the Stage—Organize the room so that the four option groups face a row of desks reserved for the Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims. Distribute "Evaluation Form" to the subcommittee members. Instruct members of the subcommittee to fill out the first part of their "Evaluation Form" during the course of the period. The second part of the worksheet should be completed as homework.

2. Managing the Simulation—Explain that the simulation will begin with three-to-five minute presentations by the option groups. Encourage students to speak clearly and convincingly.

3. Guiding Discussion—Following the presentations, invite members of the Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims to

ask clarifying questions. Make sure that each subcommittee member has an opportunity to ask at least one question. The questions should be evenly distributed among all four option groups. If time permits, encourage members of the option groups to challenge the positions of the other groups. During cross-examination, allow any option group member to respond. (As an alternative approach, permit cross-examination after the presentation of each option.)

Homework:

Students should review each of the four options in the student text (pages 18-25). Moving beyond these options they should fill out "Focusing Your Thoughts" (TRB-23) and complete "Your Option Five" (TRB-24).

Note:

The consideration of alternative views is not finished when the options role play is over. The options presented are framed in stark terms in order to clarify differences. After the role play, students should articulate their own views on the issue and create their own options for U.S. policy. These views will be more sophisticated and nuanced if students have had an opportunity to challenge one another to think more critically about the merits and trade-offs of alternative views. See Guidelines for Deliberation <<http://www.choices.edu/resources/guidelines.php>> for suggestions on deliberation.

Name: _____

Evaluation Form

Subcommittee on Immigration and Claims

Part I

What was the most persuasive argument presented in favor of this option?

What was the most persuasive argument presented against this option?

Option 1

Option 1

Option 2

Option 2

Option 3

Option 3

Option 4

Option 4

Part II

Which group presented its option most effectively? Explain your answer.

Looking into the Future

Objectives:

Students will: Articulate coherent recommendations for U.S. immigration policy based on personally held values and historical understanding.

Weigh the long-term consequences of individual policy recommendations.

Compare underlying values and assumptions about the significance of immigration with classmates.

Required Reading:

Students should have read each of the four options in the student text (pages 18-25) and completed "Focusing Your Thoughts" (TRB-23) and "Your Option Five" (TRB-24).

Handouts:

"Immigration and America in the 21st Century" (TRB-25)

In the Classroom:

1. Expressing Values—Review the beliefs in "Focusing Your Thoughts," noting the relationship between beliefs and policy options. Call on students to explain how their beliefs guided their responses in "Your Option Five."

2. Weighing Consequences—Distribute "Immigration and America in the 21st Century." Emphasize that immigration policies adopted today will greatly influence the development of the United States over the coming decades. After students read the instructions, call on them to explain how their options would affect the topics featured in the worksheet. Encourage students to distin-

guish differences among the options they have crafted. How do the options reflect contrasting values about where the United States is headed?

Extra Challenges:

As homework, instruct students to write a letter to a member of Congress, the president, or the editor of a local newspaper about their ideas for U.S. immigration policy. In the first part of the letter, students should summarize their responses to "Your Option Five," while in the second part they should assess the impact of their option on the United States over the coming decades.

Encourage students to explore the local dimension of the immigration issue. Immigration lawyers, ethnic organizations, social service centers, business associations, and religious groups are often at the forefront of the policy debate on immigration. Local political leaders could also be asked to express their opinions on the subject. In addition, students could assess the impact of recent reforms in U.S. immigration law on the local community.

Note:

"U.S. Role in the World Student Ballot" is available online at <www.choices.edu/usrole-ballot>. Students are encouraged to record their ballots online and join a nationwide debate about the U.S. role in the world. Student answers to the ballots entered online will be developed into a national report and periodically sent to the White House and members of Congress.